### **ECON 201**

# CHOICE UNDER UNCERTAINTY – CLASSICAL & CURRENT APPROACHES

Winter 2004 Professor Mark Machina T,Th 11:00 – 12:20pm

Economics Bldg. 217

Econ 300

Office Hours: Thur. 8-

11,1-2

This course will present and then examine the economist's classical model of choice under uncertainty, namely the expected utility / subjective probability model of risk preferences and beliefs. We will develop the theoretical foundations of this model in a setting of both objective and subjective uncertainty, and examine the concepts and measurement of "risk" and "risk aversion" and how these features influence economic behavior. We will then present methods of estimating and testing different features of the classical model, and give an overview of the empirical/experimental evidence that has accumulated, much of which suggests that preferences and beliefs systematically violate the underlying assumptions of the model. We conclude with an examination of the resulting development of non-expected utility models of risk preferences, and non-probabilistic models of beliefs.

- Jan. 6 Introduction & Preliminary Concepts
- Jan. 8 Expected Utility Preferences under Objective Uncertainty
- Jan. 13 Expected Utility Preferences under Objective Uncertainty (continued)
- Jan. 15 Expected Utility Risk Preferences & Probabilistic Beliefs under Subjective Uncertainty
- Jan. 20 E.U. Risk Preferences & Probabilistic Beliefs under Subjective Uncertainty (continued)
- Jan. 22 Almost-Objective Uncertainty
- Jan. 27 Analytics of Risk and Risk Aversion
- Jan. 29 Analytics of Risk and Risk Aversion (continued)
- Feb. 3 Applications of the Expected Utility Model
- Feb. 5 (Thursday) Midterm Exam
- Feb. Assessing Preferences and Beliefs

10

Feb. Evidence on the Shape of the Utility Function

12

Feb. Evidence on the Underlying Assumptions of the Classical Model

17

Feb. Expected Utility vs. Non-Expected Utility: An Introduction 19 Feb. Generalized Expected Utility Analysis 24 Feb. Dynamic Consistency and Intertemporal Choice 26 Mar. 2 Probabilistically Sophisticated Non-Expected Utility Maximizers Mar. 4 Non-Probabilistic Models of Beliefs "Robustifying" the Classical Model of Risk Preferences and Beliefs Mar. 9 "Robustifying" the Classical Model of Risk Preferences and Beliefs Mar. 11 (continued) Mar (Monday) FINAL EXAM 11:30am - 2:30pm 15

**READINGS**: The readings will consist of handouts, expository articles, and "classic" articles from the literature. All readings will be distributed in advance of the lectures.

**EXAMS**: The course grade will be determined on the basis of a Midterm and a Final Exam. I will provide practice problems, and there will be review sessions before each exam.

## **ECONOMICS 201 OUTLINE**

#### I. INTRODUCTION

a. Preliminary Concepts in Probability Theory

Probability Distributions, Probability Measures and Cumulative Distribution Functions

Expected Value, Moments and Stieltjes Integrals

Concave Functions, Convex Functions and Jensen's Inequality

Convolutions, Compound Lotteries and Probability Mixtures

b. Simple Criteria for Choice Under Uncertainty

First Order Stochastic Dominance Preference

Expected Value Criterion and the St. Petersburg Paradox

Mean-Variance Criterion

Minimax and Minimax Regret Criteria

"Safety-First" Criteria

## II. EXPECTED UTILITY RISK PREFERENCES UNDER OBJECTIVE UNCERTAINTY

a. The Structure of Expected Utility Preferences

Outcome Sets, Lotteries, Choice Sets and Decision Trees

Preferences Functionals and von Neumann-Morgenstern Utility Functions Properties of Expected Utility Preferences

The Triangle Diagram

b. Characterization of Expected Utility Preferences

Completeness and Transitivity

Mixture Continuity

The Independence Axiom

Expected Utility Representation Theorem

- c. Expected Utility Preferences Over Unbounded Distributions
- d. The Expected Utility Model Origins and Historical Misconceptions

## III. EXPECTED UTILITY RISK PREFERENCES & PROBABILISTIC BELIEFS UNDER SUBJECTIVE UNCERTAINTY

a. The State-Preference Framework

States, Events, Outcomes and Acts

Splicing Acts
Preference Functions over Subjective Acts

b. Expected Utility Preferences over Subjectively Uncertain Prospects

v-M Utility, Subjective Probability and Expected Utility Formulas

Properties of Expected Utility Preferences over Acts

Statewise/Eventwise Monotonicity

Weak Comparative Probability

Sure-Thing Principle (Separability across Events)

Savage's Theorem

The Hirshleifer-Yaari Diagram

Certainty Line, Fair-Odds Lines and Indifference Curves

Marginal Rates of Substitution and the Separability Property

"Local Risk Neutrality" at Certainty

c. Beliefs and the Hypothesis of Probabilistic Sophistication

"Separation of Preferences and Beliefs"

The Hypothesis of Probabilistic Sophistication

The Comparative Likelihood Relation

- d. Savage's Joint Characterization of Subjective Probability and Expected Utility
- e. State-Dependent Expected Utility Preferences

Motivation, Examples, and Applications

Violation of Probabilistic Sophistication and Indeterminacy of Beliefs

f. Expected Utility Preferences under Mixed Subjective-Objective Uncertainty

## IV. "ALMOST-OBJECTIVE" UNCERTAINTY

a. Properties of "Purely Objective" vs. "Purely Subjective" Events

b. Almost-Objective Events, Acts and Mixtures

Construction and Revealed Likelihood Properties of Almost-Objective

Preferences over Almost-Objective Acts and Mixtures

Why Don't We See Almost-Objective Securities?

"Objective vs. Subjective Events" rather than "Objective vs. Subjective Processes"

c. Extension to More General Events and State Spaces

#### V. ANALYTICS OF RISK AND RISK AVERSION

- a. Certainty Equivalents, Risk Premiums and Attitudes Toward Risk
- b. The Arrow-Pratt Characterization of Comparative Risk Aversion

Comparative Risk Aversion

Risk Aversion and Wealth

Ross Characterization of Comparative Risk Aversion

c. Comparative Risk and the Theory of Stochastic Dominance

First Order Stochastic Dominance

Comparative Risk

Second Order Stochastic Dominance

Third Order Stochastic Dominance

d. Comparative Statics of Risk and Risk Aversion

Results for Specific Functional Forms

General Results

Theory of Certainty Equivalence

- e. Multivariate Risk and Risk Aversion
- f. Risk and Risk Aversion under Subjective Uncertainty

Risk Attitudes in the Hirshleifer-Yaari Diagram

Risk Aversion, Risk Preference, and Comparative Risk Aversion

Demand for a Risky Asset

Risk Aversion and Wealth

State-Dependent Risk and Risk Aversion

### VI. APPLICATIONS OF THE EXPECTED UTILITY MODEL

a. Supply and Demand under Uncertainty

Price and Non-Price Uncertainty

Consumption/Savings Decisions

Do Consumers Benefit from Price Instability?

b. Demand for Insurance

Coinsurance

Deductible Insurance

Background Risk and Uninsurable Risk

Self-Insurance vs. Self-Protection

## c. Risk-Sharing and Markets for Risk

Pareto Efficient Risk-Sharing
Optimality of Deductible Insurance
Markets for Contingent Claims

#### d. Demand for Information

Value of Information Sequential Search

e. Measurement of Inequality

#### VII. ASSESSING RISK PREFERENCES AND BELIEFS

## a. Methodological Issues and Basic Techniques

Verbal versus Choice-Based Elicitation Elicitation of Truthful Responses Income Effects

## b. Assessing von Neumann-Morgenstern Utility Functions

Univariate Assessment Methods Recovery from Asset Demand Functions Multivariate Assessment Methods

## c. Assessing Subjective Probabilities

Betting Odds and "Coherence" Scoring Rules

### VIII.EVIDENCE ON THE SHAPE OF THE UTILITY FUNCTION

## a. Laboratory Evidence

Typical Findings
"Biases" in Utility Assessment

#### b. Field Evidence

Friedman-Savage Hypothesis Skewness Preference, Decreasing Absolute/Increasing Relative Risk Aversion Estimates of the Magnitude of Risk Aversion

c. Asymptotic Properties of the Utility Function

## IX. EVIDENCE ON THE UNDERLYING ASSUMPTIONS OF THE MODEL

## a. Evidence on the Independence Axiom

"Allais Paradox" and the Common Consequence Effect Common Ratio Effect Oversensitivity to Changes in the Probabilities of Low Probability Events Utility Evaluation Effect Evidence on Betweenness

## b. Evidence on Transitivity

Threshold and Cyclic Effects

c. Evidence on the Stability of Preferences

Invariance of Risk Preferences to Initial Wealth Framing Effects

Response Mode Effects and the Preference Reversal Phenomenon

d. Evidence on the Existence and Use of Subjective Probabilities

Heuristics in the Manipulation of Probabilities

The Ellsberg Paradox

Newcombe's Paradox

- e. Validity of the Evidence: Objections and Responses
- f. Theoretically Induced Violations of Expected Utility

Preferences over Delayed-Resolution Risks Group Risk Preferences

## X. EXPECTED UTILITY VS. NON-EXPECTED UTILITY: AN INTRODUCTION

a. Preferences Under Objective Uncertainty

Common Framework: Preference Functionals over Distributions Key Difference: Linearity vs. Nonlinearity in the Probabilities

b. Preferences Under Subjective Uncertainty

Common Framework: Preference Functionals over Acts Key Difference: Separability vs. Nonseparability across Events/States

c. "Cardinal" vs. "Ordinal" Preferences under Certainty and Uncertainty

# XI. NON-EXPECTED UTILITY MODELS OF PREFERENCES OVER LOTTERIES

- a. Separable Functional Forms
- b. Higher Moments of Utility and General Polynomial Forms
- c. Weighted Utility
- d. Rank-Dependent Models
- e. Expected Regret/Skew-Symmetric Bilinear Preferences
- f. Non-Expected Utility Preferences over Intertemporal Consumption Streams

## XII. GENERALIZED EXPECTED UTILITY ANALYSIS

a. Smooth Preferences and the "Local Utility Function"

Finite-Outcome Sets

Local Utility Function as a Variational Derivative

b. Theoretical Analysis

Stochastic Dominance Preference, Risk Aversion, and Comparative Risk Aversion

Comparative Statics

### c. Empirical Analysis

Skewness Preference and Hypothesis I

"Fanning Out" and Hypothesis II

Invariance of Gambling Preferences to Initial Wealth

Unbounded Probability Distributions and the St. Petersburg Paradox

### d. Applications

Temporal Risk

Cooperative Risk Sharing

"Non-Utilitarian" Social Welfare Functions

#### XIII.DYNAMIC CONSISTENCY AND INTERTEMPORAL CHOICE

- a. Static, Dynamic and Intertemporal Choice Situations
- b. Dynamic Arguments Against Non-Expected Utility Preferences

Argument that Non-Expected Utility Preferences are "Dynamically Inconsistent"

Classical "Making Book" Argument against Non-Expected Utility Preferences

Argument that Non-Expected Utility Maximizers will be "Averse to Information"

- c. Hidden Assumption in these Arguments: Consequentialism
- d. Consequentialism is Inappropriate when Preferences Are Nonseparable
- e. Dynamically Consistent Non-Expected Utility Maximizers
- f. Issues in Modeling Nonseparable Preferences Under Uncertainty
- g. Choice over Intertemporal Consumption Streams

# XIV.PROBABILISTICALLY SOPHISTICATED NON-EXPECTED UTILI' MAXIMIZERS

a. Description and Properties

Natural Examples of Probabilistically Sophisticated Non-Expected Utility Preferences

Do the Savage Axioms minus the Sure-Thing Principle imply Prob. Sophistication?

b. Strong Comparative Probability Axiom

Comparison with the Sure-Thing Principle

- c. Characterization of Probabilistically Sophisticated Non-Expected Utility Preferences
- d. Conditional Preferences and Conditional Probability
- e. "Minimal" Conditions for Probabilistic Sophistication
  The Horse-Roulette Replacement Axiom
- f. Meaning of "Bayesian Rationality"

## XVI."ROBUSTIFYING" THE CLASSICAL MODEL OF RISK PREFERENCES & BELIEFS

B: Event-Incoretic Representation of the Classical Model